

RUAPEHU DISTRICT COUNCIL

MINUTES

MEETING HELD IN THE TAUMARUNUI ROOM (COUNCIL CHAMBER),
HUIA STREET, TAUMARUNUI, ON TUESDAY 20 OCTOBER 2009
COMMENCING AT 10.08AM

PUBLIC BUSINESS

PRESENT

Mayor	Sue Morris	
Councillors	Bruce Broderson	Taumarunui Ward
	Don Cameron	Waimarino-Waiouru Ward
	Ron Cooke	Taumarunui Ward
	Graeme Cosford	Taumarunui Ward
	Cynthia Dowsett	Waimarino-Waiouru Ward
	Marion Gillard	Ohura Ward
	Jeni Kydd	Taumarunui Ward
	Karen Ngatai	Taumarunui Ward
	Murray Wilson	National Park Ward
Staff	David Hammond	Chief Executive
	Chris Impson	Governance Manager
	Warren Furner	Team Leader Land Transport
	Pauline Love	Team Leader Strategic Development
	Narelle Gray	Policy Planner

1 **APOLOGIES** A05-0014

RESOLVED

That the apologies received from Deputy Mayor John Compton and Cr Ronald Frew be received and Leave of Absence granted.

2 **451748 – HEARING OF SUBMISSIONS TO REPRESENTATION REVIEW** L40-0003

Members considered a report regarding Representation Review Hearing dates. The following submissions were heard:

Submission No 7 - John Howard

Mr Howard expressed concerns about the proposed northern rural ward. He wondered if effective representation would be undermined by the very large area covered. It is an onus on Council to demonstrate how it will provide for fair and reasonable representation for the Ward. He opposes the dissolution of Community Boards put posed alternatives. He suggested that perhaps the Waimarino-Waiouru and National Park Community Boards could be united or perhaps Council could have Ward or Standing Committees instead, with community representatives being appointed to the Committee.

Submission No 13 - Jim Paul

Mr Paul did not attend the meeting to speak to his submission.

Submission No 14 - Darko Byelich

Mr Byelich is concerned that the rise of local residents and ratepayer associations/lobby groups has taken over the role Community Boards have been doing in the communities. The groups can dominate Council's decisions but are focussed on their particular interests only. They do not appear to be concerned about the whole District. He also queried what would happen to current financial debts if boundaries changed. He was advised that the same funding mechanism would remain, unless Council conscientiously decided to change its Revenue and Financing Policy.

The meeting adjourned from 10.50 am to 11.00 am to await the next submitters.

Submission No 20 - Federated Farmers (Ruapehu)

Lyn Neeson (President), Kelly Martyn (Policy Planner), Tim Mathews (Chair, Wanganui), Jim Walker (Speaker) made this presentation. Federated Farmers thanked Council for bringing the issues into the public debate. The organisation totally supports the proposal, both relating to Wards and number of Councillors. The organisation supports the abolition of Community Boards. It was suggested that a Ward Committee could do the same job. Ms Martyn explained that there is no real comparison between the Auckland situation and Ruapehu Community Boards. With a population of \$13,500 Community Boards are giving a representation of one member per 250 residents. The Group believes there to be over-representation in a smaller population. Federated Farmers are in favour of non-statutory groups in the community who would be willing to attend unpaid meetings on a regular basis.

Submission No 4 - David Holland

Mr Holland spoke on Ward Boundaries, Community Boards and Representation. There are three options for Ward boundaries – the advertised option (he believes this is unsustainable), the status quo, or the status quo plus with south of Owhango into the Southern Rural Ward. He suggested that the number of representatives and Councillors on Community Boards could be reduced, so that they could take care of the “nuts and bolts” of concerns in the community. Mr Holland advocated for local representation through more informal community meetings with unpaid attendances. He asked if Council could take the matter of representation (2001 Amendment) to the Local Government Commission for review and to go back to the previous legislated model.

Submission No 21 - National Park Village Progressive Assoc Inc

Jenni Pendleton (Chairperson) spoke on behalf of the Association. At the AGM of the Association held recently, some out-of-District residents raised questions regarding rural and urban wards: The non-resident population in this District is very significant. Members questioned how the Council decision was made and why there was little consultation. They feel that Council is trying to combine disparate communities. The group did not perceive any obvious benefits to the proposal and felt that more consultation should have been undertaken prior to the decision being made. Ms Pendleton was advised that the Statement of Proposal was the consultation process and no final decision was yet made.

RESOLVED

- 1 That the Report on Hearing of Submissions be received.*
- 2 That the verbal submissions from the following, as presented in support of written submissions to the Representation Review be noted and referred for consideration at the deliberations meeting to be held on Tuesday 27 October 2009 in Raetihi.*

<i>Submission No 7</i>	<i>John Howard</i>
<i>Submission No 14</i>	<i>Darko Byelich</i>
<i>Submission No 20</i>	<i>Federated Farmers (Ruapehu)</i>
<i>Submission No 21</i>	<i>National Park Village Assoc Inc</i>
<i>Submission No 4</i>	<i>David Holland</i>

The meeting adjourned at 12.20 pm, to be reconvened in Raetihi on Tuesday 27 October 2008 at 9.30am.

SUE MORRIS
MAYOR

RUAPEHU DISTRICT COUNCIL

MINUTES

MEETING HELD IN THE RAETIHI ROOM (COUNCIL CHAMBER),
CR DUNCAN/SEDDON STREETS, RAETIHI, ON TUESDAY 27 OCTOBER 2009
COMMENCING AT 9.35AM

PUBLIC BUSINESS

PRESENT

Mayor	Sue Morris	(Chair after lunch break)
Deputy Mayor:	John Compton	Waimarino-Waiouru Ward (Chair until lunch break)
Councillors	Bruce Broderson	Taumarunui Ward
	Don Cameron	Waimarino-Waiouru Ward
	Ron Cooke	Taumarunui Ward
	Graeme Cosford	Taumarunui Ward
	Cynthia Dowsett	Waimarino-Waiouru Ward
	Ronald Frew	Waimarino-Waiouru Ward
	Marion Gillard	Ohura Ward
	Jeni Kydd	Taumarunui Ward
	Karen Ngatai	Taumarunui Ward (arrived at
	Murray Wilson	National Park Ward
Staff	David Hammond	Chief Executive
	Chris Impson	Governance Manager
	Pauline Love	Team Leader Strategic Development
	Narelle Gray	Strategic Planner

Note: In the absence of Mayor Sue Morris, the Deputy Chairperson, John Compton, assumed the Chair for the morning.

1 APOLOGIES

M35-0001

Note: Mayor Sue Morris had tendered her apology for the morning part of the meeting, due to another commitment.

RESOLVED

That the apologies received from Mayor Sue Morris (for the morning only) and Karen Ngatai (for lateness) be received and Leave of Absence granted.

2 451748 – HEARING OF SUBMISSIONS TO REPRESENTATION REVIEW (continued)

L40-0003

The following submissions were heard:

Submission No 3 - Ohakune 2000

Mr Kroll thanks Councillors for holding Hearings in the south of the District. Ohakune 2000 questioned the need for drawing boundaries around urban and rural areas. More important than boundaries was the right candidate. He questioned the definition of rural and urban. Rural is 80% farm businesses and 20% residential, so the proposal ring fences a business sector group. Mr Kroll believes that ring fencing is wrong. The whole District is rural and is one District. Ohakune 2000 would like the status quo or, if necessary, make small changes. Community Boards are a democratic tool to have Council address the needs of the community. He suggested that Council creates a Community Board that can be delegated to make decisions within the Act. He also suggested that if there was to be a change, the number of Community Board members could be reduced to five, with only one Councillor. Ohakune 2000 does not want to become a political organisation in place of a Community Board. Mr Kroll there are many issues that could be dealt with at Community Board level, with no need for these issues to come before full Council.

Cr Ngatai entered the meeting at 9.54am towards the end of Mr Kroll's submission.

Submission No 6 - Deryck Brown

Mr Brown commented on the cost of running Community Boards. He does not believe Council will save the \$159,000 quoted on rates. He believed that the proposed system is akin to a "communist" one. He cited an example of Waimarino-Waiouru Community Board being consulted widely on a complex community issue before the item was presented to Council for approval. Mr Brown pointed out the issues in common with Waimarino-Waiouru and National Park Community Boards and believes that it would be good to combine these two Community Boards. He was agreeable to the community forming an unpaid group.

Cr Cameron entered the meeting at 10.03am, part-way through Mr Brown's submission.

Submission No 9 - Allan Whale

Mr Whale supported Ohakune 2000 and Mr Brown's submissions. He believes that Community Boards fill an important role and he does not think their removal will save any money. Mr Whale questioned Council's staffing levels at Board meetings to speak to a report that is already on the Agenda. (Mr Whale was advised that staff are not paid extra to attend Board meetings – it is part of their salary.) He questioned if Council is getting value for money from its contractors.

Submission No 11 - Winston Oliver

Mr Oliver spoke about effective and fair representation. In his view, the proposal is much more satisfactory than the current situation. He wants to see a dedicated rural Councillor who would look after rural roading. Mr Oliver does not feel that rural people are fairly represented at present. He is in favour of "partitioned" Community Boards (electing from within defined geographic areas) and the present Council proposal.

Submission No 16 - Bruce Thompson

Mr Thompson believes the current system is good and it should remain for Waimarino-Waiouru. He believes the National Park urban area leans towards the south and the rural area towards the north. He believes the Community Board should remain and that all Ward Councillors and the full Community Board should remain. A considered recommendation can then be made to Council with the support of all Ward members and community representatives. Community Board members are not there for the pay – they are there to get a voice back to Council.

Submission No 18 - Lyn Pope

Ms Pope believes that Community Boards are needed because we there are not enough people making submissions. Ratepayers need to have people they can go to, who will take their concerns to Council. There needs to be a public forum that anyone can listen to, so that people with alternative views can be heard. If the current system is not working, then that is the fault of the implementation, not the idea. She is totally in favour of retaining Community Boards to make sure that the voice of the people can be heard.

The meeting adjourned at 10.50am to await the next submitter and resumed at 11.10am.

Submission No 23 – Tim Mathews - Federated Farmers (Wanganui)

Mr Mathews advised that Wanganui Branch represents the area south of National Park and two Maori Incorporations. It has examined how the Electoral Commission would look at the proposal. The Group has looked at different proposals and made several recommendations in its submission, eg, joining National Park urban area to the southern ward. He suggests that Council look at the Rangitikei Community Board model, which has a Ward Committee and voluntary community meetings. He presented models of an urban and rural property, to compare the rates and relative costs for services. He gave an example of how Wanganui District Council operates also.

Submission No 22 - David Scott

Mr Scott did not attend to make a submission.

Submission No 24 - John (Luigi) Hotter

Mr Hotter did not attend to make a submission.

RESOLVED

That this item lie on the table until after the lunch break.

452299 – RESOLUTION TO EXCLUDE THE PUBLIC FOR CONSIDERATION OF COUNCIL BUSINESS

RESOLVED

- 1 That the report on Resolution to Exclude the Public for Consideration of Council Business is received.
- 2 That the public is excluded from the following part of the proceedings of the meeting.
- 3 That Council agrees the Chief Executive Governance Manager, Team Leader Strategic Development and Strategic Planner, having relevant knowledge, remain in attendance, to assist Council with its decision-making.
- 4 That the general subject of each matter to be discussed while the public is excluded, the reason for passing the resolution in relation to each matter and the specific grounds under Section 48(1) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 for the passing of this resolution are as follows:

General Subject of each matter to be considered	Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter	Ground(s) under S 48(1) for passing this resolution
451221 – Environment Court Appeal	The exclusion of the public is necessary to enable the local authority to deliberate in private on its decisions or recommendations before a local authority where the local authority is required, by any enactment, to make a recommendation in respect of the matter that is the subject of those proceedings.	48(1)(a)

This resolution is made in reliance on Section 48(1)(a) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 and the particular interest or interests protected by Section 6 or Section 7 of that Act or Section 6 or Section 7 or Section 9 of the Official Information Act 1982 as the case may require are listed above.

RESUMPTION OF PUBLIC BUSINESS

2 451748 – HEARING OF SUBMISSIONS TO REPRESENTATION REVIEW (continued)

L40-0003

RESOLVED

That this item be uplifted from the table.

RESOLVED

That the verbal submissions from the following, as presented in support of written submissions to the Representation Review be noted.

Submission No 3	Ohakune 2000
Submission No 6	Deryck Brown
Submission No 9	Allan Whale
Submission No 11	Winston Oliver
Submission No 16	Bruce Thompson
Submission No18	Lyn Pope
Submission No 23	Federated Farmers (Wanganui)

The meeting adjourned for lunch at 11.50am and resumed at 1.08pm. The Mayor was present and assumed the Chair on resumption of the meeting.

3 **451202 – DELIBERATION OF SUBMISSIONS ON THE REPRESENTATION REVIEW**

Council considered a report summarising the submissions received on the Representation Review Consultation.

RESOLVED

- 1 *That the Report on Deliberations of Submissions on Representation Review be received.*
- 2 *That the late submissions from Peter and Ada Parkinson and Peter Gendell be received.*
- 3 *That the Ward structure remain as the status quo for the 2010 election (ie, Ohura, Taumarunui, National Park and Waimarino-Waiouru Wards).*
- 4 *That all Community Boards in the Ruapehu District are disestablished for the 2010 Election.*
- 5 *That Council recommends to the incoming 2010 Council, the establishment of a North and South Elected Member Ward Committee structure to act, for all intents and purposes, as Community Boards.*

Mayor Sue Morris and Crs Karen Ngatai and Marion Gillard requested that their votes AGAINST part 3 of the resolution be recorded. Cr Bruce Broderson abstained from voting on part 3.

The Mayor called for a Division on part 4 of the above resolution. The voting was:

FOR: Crs Ron Cooke, Karen Ngatai, Marion Gillard, Murray Wilson, Graeme Cosford, Jeni Kydd, Bruce Broderson and Mayor Sue Morris.

AGAINST: Crs John Compton, Cynthia Dowsett, Ronald Frew and Don Cameron.

Cr John Compton requested this his vote AGAINST part 5 of the resolution be recorded.

There being no further business the meeting concluded at 2.50pm.

Dated at Taumarunui this 27th day of November 2009.

SUE MORRIS
MAYOR